

## College of Liberal Arts

### Diversity and Inclusion Resource Model

#### TOPIC: The Development of Ethnic/Racial Attitudes and Ethnic/Racial Identity

Author: Dr. Amber Williams, Psychology and Child Development, California Polytechnic State University

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	2
II.	Outline.....	3
III.	Annotated Bibliography for Instructors.....	7
IV.	Annotated Bibliography for Students.....	10
V.	Classroom Activities.....	12
VI.	Media Resources.....	15
VII.	Tips and Pitfalls.....	17

## Introduction

Ethnic/racial identity (i.e., the meaning and importance individuals place on their ethnic/racial background) and ethnic/racial attitudes (i.e., a person's attitudes toward and beliefs about ethnicity/race and ethnic/racial groups) have a number of implications for how people think about themselves and others and the nature of their interpersonal relationships. The nature of these constructs and their association with other important outcomes also vary significantly based on a number of factors, including the person's ethnic/racial background, their developmental stage, and their environment.

While many believe children do not see race, research contradicts this widespread belief. Children show visual preferences as early as 3 months (i.e., looking at same-race faces longer than other-race faces, Bar-Haim, Ziv, Lamy, & Hodes, 2006). Research has also shown that White children show in-group racial biases as early as 3 and reliably by 4 or 5 (e.g., Aboud 1988; Kurtz-Costes, DeFreitas, Halle, & Kinlaw, 2011). Children of color tend to show more neutral attitudes overall with some children displaying out-group biases and others showing in-group biases (Aboud, 1988).

In adolescence, identity becomes more salient and identity exploration becomes an especially important task (Erikson, 1968; Marcia, 1980). Among children of color, race and ethnicity may be aspects of identity that are particularly relevant due to these children's experiences with being "different" from the mainstream and potentially experiencing discrimination (Tatum, 1997). Though especially relevant in adolescence, ethnic/racial identity development is a lifelong process and is relevant at many stages throughout the lifespan. In this module, I will discuss ethnic/racial attitude development, ethnic/racial identity development, and the implications of ethnic/racial attitudes and ethnic/racial identity for the classroom and therapeutic environments.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> I use the term "race" primarily to describe articles/videos that focus on White, Asian, and Black people; I use "ethnicity/race" to discuss articles/videos that focus on Black, Latinx, White, Indigenous, and/or Asian people; I use "ethnicity" primarily to discuss articles/videos that focus on Latinx people. If articles/videos specifically identify as discussing "race" or "ethnicity," I use their provided terms. I acknowledge that this, however, is dynamic and complex terminology that differs across discipline, culture, and historical time.

## Outline

### I. Racial attitude development (infancy to adolescence)

**Infancy:** Despite the prevailing belief that children do not see skin color, children's observations of race begin as early as infancy. In infancy, children distinguish same from different race faces and show visual preferences for same-race faces in contexts in which they are exposed mostly to prototypical same-race faces (e.g., Bar-Haim et al., 2006).

Additionally, research shows that infants have trouble distinguishing between other-race faces as early as 3-6 months of age - this is known as the Other Race Effect (Kelly, Quinn, Slater, Lee, Ge, & Pascalis, 2007; Sangrioli & de Schonen, 2004). However, one study found that training (i.e., exposing infants to multiple other-race faces) may reduce the Other Race Effect. This suggests that infants who are exposed to diverse settings may be better able to distinguish between other-race faces (Sangrioli & de Schonen, 2004). Thus, race has implications for children's observations and recognition of others early in life. However, while infants show ability to observe racial differences, their social choices are not related to race until after 2.5 years of age (Kinzler & Spelke, 2011).

**Early childhood:** White children show biased attitudes toward White individuals as early as 3 years and more reliably by 4-5 (Aboud, 1988; Aboud, 2003; Kinzler, Shutts, DeJesus, & Spelke, 2009; Kurtz-Costes et al., 2011). On the other hand, Black children show more neutral racial attitudes, with some children showing in-group bias, some being truly neutral, and others showing out-group (White) bias (Aboud, 1988; Clark & Clark, 1947). The limited research on non-Black children of color suggests a similar pattern as Black children (Aboud, 1988; Stokes-Guinan, 2011).

**Middle childhood:** White children's in-group racial biases begin to decrease by ages 5 to 7 (Aboud, 1988; Baron & Banaji, 2006). However, these attitudes are often explicit. Baron and Banaji (2006) found that there was little change in White children's implicit attitudes between ages 6 and 10 (another study contradicted this finding and may be worth exploring: Williams & Steele, 2017). The research exploring the attitudes of children of color is limited at this stage; however, a meta-analysis of racial/ethnic/national prejudice suggests that children of color may begin to feel less positively toward White people between 5-7 and 8-10 years (Raabe & Beelmann, 2011).

**Adolescence:** At this developmental stage, adolescents' exploration of their identity intensifies. Erickson proposed that adolescents face a challenge at this stage: identity vs. role confusion (Erikson, 1968). For adolescents of color, this developmental stage becomes particularly important with regard to developing an understanding of their ethnic/racial identity specifically. According to Tatum's *Why are All the Black Kids Sitting Together in the Cafeteria?*, ethnic/racial

identity becomes especially important for students of color because as they age, they experience and notice racial and ethnic discrimination at the hands of peers. When they go to their White friends for comfort, their feelings are often invalidated. Thus, they often become closer to same-ethnicity/race friends.

## II. Racial identity development theories

William Cross's Nigrescence Theory: Cross developed the Nigrescence theory to understand African American identity development - specifically, the model sought to explain how African Americans manage to come to terms with their racial identity in a society that devalues and discriminates against them. It should be noted that many racial identity models for people of color have been modeled after this one. The proposed stages are as follows:

1. *Pre-Encounter*: The individual originally experiences either (1) a sense of internalized racism, seeing Whiteness as idealized and Blackness as negative OR (2) an assimilationist/non-racialized identity that downplays race as unimportant.
2. *Encounter*: Individuals then experience an event (or series of events) that changes their perceptions (e.g., a racist incident witnessed or experienced) that throws their previous beliefs (or lack thereof) about race into question. An anger toward White individuals for prior miseducation/mistreatment may also develop during this stage.
3. *Immersion/Emersion*: A highly black and white image of the pre-encounter/old self and new self is constructed. The old self is considered entirely wrong and useless while the new self is over-romanticized. Understanding of the self lacks complexity. Whiteness is demonized, while Blackness is idealized. This leads into "emersion," which involves a leveling off of intense, black and white thinking - moving toward a more complex understanding of and commitment to Blackness.
4. *Internalization*: The person still sees Blackness as an important part of their lives and acknowledges the existence and experience of racism but has less hatred toward White people and is less concerned with the hyper-performance of Blackness. Thus, the person is secure in their Blackness in more normative ways. This may result in beginning to bridge lost friendships and also create connections with other marginalized groups. However, it is important to note that there are a number of ideologies, ranging from multiculturalism to nationalism, that may exist within internalization.
5. *Internalization-Commitment*: Not always included in mainstream discussions of Nigrescence because it was later combined with stage 4. This is distinguishable from internalization due to a sense of commitment on the part of the individual, which may involve participating in activism and organizing related to Black equality and liberation efforts.

Helm's White RID Model: This model was developed to understand White racial identity development. The end goal would be to establish an anti-racist White identity. The proposed stages are as follows:

1. *Contact*: Individual accepts and embraces the status-quo when it comes to race; does not really consider race critically or consciously. Characterized by obliviousness and passive acceptance of current racial hierarchies.
2. *Distintegration*: Information contradicting personal race-related beliefs throws individual into disequilibrium. Feels ambiguous and anxious about in-group loyalty and pride vs. equitable treatment of other racial groups.
3. *Reintegration*: Individual strengthens sense of in-group loyalty and out-group denigration; conscious preference for the in-group.
4. *Pseudoindependence*: In-group preference is still strong, but individual feels motivated to superficially value racial equality; may be in the form of "helping" other groups or uneducated claims about how to solve race-related problems.
5. *Immersion/Emersion*: Exploration and (re)education on the meaning of racism and the ways in which one is implicated in the perpetuation of a racist society. Redefinition of Whiteness and understanding of the self.
6. *Autonomy*: Complex understanding of race and self and willingness to forgo racial privilege for the sake of equity.

### III. Ethnic/racial attitude development and ethnic/racial identity and education

It becomes important to understand ethnic/racial identity in the context of teaching. Below are some specific ways in which ethnic/racial identity can factor into educational contexts (*note*: the readings provided in the annotated bibliographies are meant to be a starting point for addressing the issues outlined below):

- A. ***In teacher training courses***: As teachers are being taught about child development, understanding of their knowledge of social categories like race and ethnicity is often missing. However, racial issues in the classroom may arise and children may ask questions that catch teachers off guard (e.g., "Why is Mya's skin so dark?" or "I don't like brown people"). For many preschool/Kindergarten aged children, the classroom will be their first opportunity to interact with people of different ethnic/racial backgrounds. Additionally, ethnic/racial biases develop early and can be difficult to change as children grow older and their explicitly biased attitudes are expressed more implicitly. Thus intentionally and proactively discussing ethnic/racial diversity and discrimination in the classroom (in developmentally appropriate ways) may be beneficial for future teachers.

While elementary age is an important and rapidly changing developmental period, it should be noted that understanding of ethnicity/race, ethnic-racial identity, and ethnic/racial discrimination also play significant roles for adolescents. During this time, adolescents of color are exploring their

identity and ethnicity/race - in part because it is often “othered” for people of color and because people experience discrimination as a result of being a person of color. It is important that teachers not ignore the psychosocial and emotional needs of adolescent students in this area. Developing skills to discuss ethnicity/race effectively in the classroom can be greatly beneficial for all students, validating and providing effective coping strategies for students of color and increasing ethnic/racial understanding and reducing bias in White students.

- B. ***In counseling courses:*** Helms (1995) notes that knowledge of racial identity may be more informative than knowledge of a client’s racial background. Ethnic/racial identity not only provides a therapist or counselor with demographic information about a client, but also provides information about the lens through which they understand their ethnicity/race and ethnicity/race-related experiences. For example, the approach to a Black client who is in the pre-encounter stage may be very different from the approach to a Black client in the immersion/emersion stage. This information can help guide counselors’ development of strategies. There is a large literature on individual racial identity and counseling psychology that will be useful for an in-depth analysis of how racial identity can inform counseling.
- C. ***In courses discussing difficult topics related to race and ethnicity:*** As noted by Tatum (1992), it is important to consider student ethnic/racial identity in classes in which difficult discussions about race and ethnicity are expected to arise. Understanding student ethnic/racial identity development can help professors develop strategies for student engagement, address student disagreements and concerns, and discuss these issues with students so that *they* can anticipate them as they go through the class. Students therefore have an opportunity to anticipate their reactions (e.g., anger, defensiveness) and address them in intentional rather than reactive ways (see also Cardoza, 2006).

## Annotated Bibliography for Instructors

### I. Articles on the development of racial cognition: Theories and findings

- A. Aboud, F. E. (1988). *Children and prejudice*. New York: Blackwell.

This is a relatively short book that is one of the most comprehensive discussions of findings regarding trends in ethnic/racial prejudice in children. While the book is relatively old, many recent findings have been relatively consistent. Aboud discusses topics beyond prejudice. She also discusses ethnic/racial categorization abilities and when they emerge. While the majority of the chapters focus on the development of White and Black kids' racial attitudes, there are some chapters that discuss Latinx, Asian, and Indigenous communities' ethnic/racial attitudes. This book might be particularly useful when teaching an education or psychology class on child development.

- B. Bigler, R. S., & Liben, L. S. (2006). A developmental intergroup theory of social stereotypes and prejudice. In R. V. Kail (Ed.), *Advances in child development and behavior* (pp. 39-89). San Diego, CA: Elsevier.  
doi:10.1016/S0065-2407(06)80004-2

This is a comprehensive theory paper exploring the circumstances under which children develop stereotypical and prejudicial attitudes toward a certain group. It also examines how stereotypes are strengthened over time and why they may be so difficult to overcome. While this paper is particularly relevant to the ethnic/racial focus of this module, it is relevant for other types of social identity prejudice/stereotyping as well (e.g., gender/sexism).

- C. Hirschfeld, L. A. (1995a). Do children have a theory of race? *Cognition*, 54(2), 209–252. doi:10.1016/0010-0277(95)91425-R

This paper includes a series of studies that have been foundational in our understanding of children's beliefs about skin color and race. In these studies, Hirschfeld (1995) proposes that children see race not merely as a perceptual category, but also as a biologically based category. This is a debatable stance, given that Hirschfeld's studies examine skin color and children's beliefs about its biological underpinnings (Hirschfeld finds that children as early as 4 see skin color as a heritable trait, such that a Black child adopted by a White family would grow up to be Black). However, he does not examine race as a category per se. One study that examined whether children see race as passing down traits through heritability found that children's willingness to, for example, say that a Black person (adopted by White parents) will have a certain trait because of their biological parents is limited (Mandalaywala et al., 2019).

- II. Articles on racial/ethnic identity (may be useful for a class focusing on racial identity of specific racial groups - not comprehensive, but most well-established theories - many of which, especially the Nigrescence theory, have been used as a foundation to establish racial identity models for other racial/ethnic groups).

- A. Cross, W. E., Jr. (1995). The psychology of nigrescence: Revising the Cross model. In J. G. Ponterotto, J. M. Casas, L. A. Suzuki, & C. M. Alexander (Eds.), *Handbook of multicultural counseling* (pp. 93-122). Thousand Oaks, CA, US: Sage Publications, Inc.

This article is valuable for a discussion of not only the Nigrescence model (a model that is foundational to our understanding of other racial identity theories), but also for discussing critiques of the Nigrescence model and other racial identity models more generally. The article also goes into detail discussing the evolution of the Nigrescence model from its original development in 1971 to 1995. This article also discusses racial identity in the context of a range of topics including psychology, American and Ethnic Studies, Black art, and history.

- B. Gautier, M. C. P. (2016). Ethnic Identity and Latino Youth: The Current State of the Research. *Adolescent Research Review*, 1(4), 329-340.

This is a review of current theoretical and measurement issues around ethnic identity development for Latinx youth. They explore a number of conceptualizations and measures. The authors also discuss studies examining the relations between ethnic identity and environment. This article would be good for understanding Latinx ethnic identity and exploring the existing research and the issues in the field.

- C. Chen, G. A., LePhuoc, P., Guzman, M. R., Rude, S. S., Dodd, B. G. (2006). Exploring Asian American racial identity. *Cultural Diversity & Ethnic Minority Psychology*, 12(3), 461-476.

Chen and colleagues (2006) explore racial identity development among Asian American individuals. They use Helms's People of Color Identity Model (see Helms, 1995 for description) and the People of Color Racial Identity Attitude Scale (based on Helms's model) to analyze racial identity statuses for Asian Americans. They also compare the statuses to measures of race-related stress and color-blind ideology.

- D. Poston, W. C. (1990). The biracial identity development model: A needed addition. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 69(2), 152-155.

This paper addresses the racial identity development of biracial individual with a counseling psychological lens (making it a good paper for a class focusing on therapeutic and counseling methods, especially as it relates to



racial identity among bi/multiracial individuals). The paper proposes a model for understanding biracial identity development. Students may be encouraged to critique the assumptions of the paper (and other racial identity models) in terms of what an ideal racial identity looks like for biracial individuals (i.e., accepting both racial identities equally). Other papers propose that there are other possible healthy, adaptive identity choices (i.e., identifying with one racial group; Root, 1990).

### III. Articles on racial identity and classroom education

- A. Tatum, B. (1992). Talking about race, learning about racism: The application of racial identity development theory in the classroom. *Harvard Educational Review*, 62(1), 1-25.

This article is good for instructors who are looking to understand student reactions to being taught about oppression, privilege, and racism. Tatum couches students' reactions to discussions of racism in ethnic/racial identity development. Tatum describes Cross's Nigrescence theory of African American racial identity development and Helms's White identity development model (note: her discussion of these two theories can be made into excerpts that can be shared with students who are learning about racial identity development). She then discusses ways in which instructors can leverage this knowledge to create a more positive class climate. Tatum recommends discussing ethnic/racial identity development with classes in which racism will be discussed (even if the class is not psychology; ethnic studies, education, history courses or any course where racism will be a central theme in the course). She says that this will help students contextualize their reactions, recognize them, and push through moments of discomfort, guilt, and anger. She also has activities she recommends for helping students think critically about their racial identity in such classes.

- B. Cardoza, K. M. (2006). When history hurts: Racial identity development in the American Studies classroom. *American Studies*, 47(3/4), 167-192.

Cardoza examines how the topics discussed in American Studies classrooms, including racism, imperialism, etc. may have important effects on students. Largely using Tatum's (1997) *Why are All the Black Kids Sitting Together in the Cafeteria?* Cardoza discusses how addressing students' ethnic/racial identity in the classroom - and how students' ethnic/racial identity may affect their reaction to course material in the social sciences and humanities - is important pedagogically. Cardoza provides suggestions for effectively addressing ethnic/racial identity development in the classroom. This article targets American Studies but is relevant for any course in which discussions of race or ethnicity occur.

### Annotated Bibliography for Students

- I. Tatum, B. D. (1997). *Why are all the Black kids sitting together in the cafeteria?: And other conversations about race*. New York, NY: Hachette Book Group.

This book is an excellent introduction to understanding the development of racial attitudes and racial identity. Dr. Beverly Tatum discusses the ways in which Black children (and children generally) come to understand race and how parents can effectively address such questions. Tatum also discusses racial identity development in Black adolescents - for example, they begin to develop more same-race friendships in part in an effort to avoid racial discrimination and to commiserate with peers who understand. The book also discusses the ethnic/racial identity development of White, Asian, Latinx, and Multiracial individuals. It ends with tips for having productive cross-race dialogue about race and racism. This book is good for college students at any stage given it lacks discipline-specific jargon.

- II. Raabe, T., & Beelmann, A. (2011). Development of ethnic, racial, and national prejudice in childhood and adolescence: A multinational meta-analysis of age differences. *Child Development*, 82(6), 1715-1737.

This paper is a meta-analysis of studies exploring the development of ethnic, racial, and national prejudice from ages 2 to 19. It is a good paper to introduce students to an overview of the research on the development of prejudice and how it differs depending on whether someone is a member of a privileged vs. marginalized group. The authors conclude that privileged children show more prejudice early and that prejudice increases until about 5-7 years, after which prejudice decreases. At the same time, prejudice levels of children in marginalized groups tend to increase between 5-7 and 8-10 years of age. There are other moderating variables considered as well, including children's exposure to racially diverse individuals. It is important to have students explore how these variables may come together. Additionally, it should be noted that the data doesn't include means, only trends. So it can be difficult to determine whether children start off high in prejudice or low in prejudice - only whether they decrease or increase.

- III. Umana-Taylor, A. J., Quintana, S. M., Lee, R.M., ...Seaton, E. (2014). Ethnic and racial identity during adolescence and into young adulthood: An integrated conceptualization. *Child Development*, 85(1), 21-39.

This article provides a broad overview of ethnic and racial identity development over the period of adolescence and young adulthood. It provides an overview of

1. The main areas of ethnic/racial identity (e.g., centrality, salience)
2. Differences in various models' focus (e.g., process vs. content)

3. How various factors may relate to ethnic/racial identity development (e.g., cognition, socialization, immigration status)
4. The ways in which ethnic/racial identity relates to psychosocial, behavioral, and academic outcomes
5. How the process and content of ethnic/racial identity may change across development

This article would be ideal for a brief overview of the nature of ethnic/racial identity (across ethnic/racial groups, but specifically focusing on people of color) and the research that has been conducted thus far. Note that some of the language used is discipline-specific so this may need to be explained to early career or non-psychology major undergraduates.

- IV. Helms, J. E. (1995). An update of Helms's white and people of color racial identity models. In J.G. Ponterotto, J.M. Casas, L.A. Suzuki, & C.M. Alexander (Eds.), *Handbook of multicultural counseling* (pp. 181-198). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Helms discusses adaptations she has made to her White and people of color identity models. She discusses common critiques to racial identity development, addressing issues around the dynamic and non-linear nature of racial identity. Helms also discusses in Tables 9.1 and 9.2 the White and people of color racial identity models, respectively. The people of color identity model is quite similar to the Cross model, though different in that it is meant to apply to people of color broadly rather than only African Americans. This article is useful for discussing critiques of racial identity models and how they may be addressed and for discussing White and people of color identity models broadly. It is also useful for discussing differences in the goals of racial identity development for White people and people of color. Finally, the article also addresses how understanding racial identity status can aid counselors in developing effective techniques (rather than relying on demographic knowledge alone).

## Classroom Activities

### I. Racial Identity Development Reflection (20-30 mins.)

- A. Students are presented with the relevant information regarding ethnic/racial identity development. The theories you decide to present are up to you (there are many of them), but may depend on who is in your class. Be careful not to assume students' ethnic/racial background. It may be a good idea to ask about students' ethnic/racial identification at the beginning before including certain ethnic/racial identity models. Another method may be having a set number of theories (e.g., Nigrescence, Poston's Biracial identity model, Helms's White identity model, etc.) and one theory focused on people of color broadly (e.g., Helms's People of Color racial identity model) (10 mins).
- B. Students then discuss where they think they are in their own ethnic/racial identity development. Students are also asked to discuss their journey through earlier stages (if the stage they are currently in is after the first/initial). Have students consider whether they have skipped stages or returned to earlier ones, which can help students think critically about the limitations of ethnic/racial identity models emphasizing linear developmental stages (10 mins).
- C. *Optional:* Have students discuss their ethnic/racial identity in small groups. Ideally, these groups would be racially mixed so that students have an opportunity to hear about different experiences with multiple ethnic/racial identity models. Students can also discuss the limitations of the models and whether they feel the models accurately reflect their own experiences (10 mins).

### II. Childhood Reflection

- A. Students are asked to reflect on their earliest memory of what they knew or believed about their own ethnicity/race or the ethnic/racial background of others. Secondly, students are to discuss where they heard their first messages about ethnicity/race and what those messages were. Third, students are asked to discuss the messages they got throughout their lives up to high school (childhood to adolescence) from parents, peers, and other adults in their lives.
- B. Students then discuss their memories of their developing knowledge of ethnicity/race and the messages they received about ethnicity/race with classmates. Ideally, students would be able to be in groups that are ethnically/racially mixed, but with at least two students of color in each group (e.g., in order to ensure that students of color don't feel isolated in discussions). Students should be encouraged to think about how

ethnic/racial background, age, and ethnic/racial composition of their environment affected their experiences. Finally, students should be able to connect their experiences to theories of child ethnic/racial attitude development (see Bigler & Liben, 2006; Raabe & Beelmann, 2010, etc.).

- III. Survey/Interview Assignment: This may be a major assignment that would encompass interviewing a child and/or adolescent about their thinking about ethnicity/race. Interviewing both parties would encourage discussion about developmental differences. Alternatively, interviewing children of different ethnic/racial backgrounds could also be fruitful for comparison.
- A. Interview with a child between ages 4 and 6. This interview could include open-ended questions or a survey. A survey could include questions about their ethnic/racial socialization (Has your mom ever told you that it is good to be friends with people of different ethnicities/races?) or questions about their own ethnic/racial preferences (How happy would it be to have a Black person as your friend?). A forced choice questionnaire is also a possibility (a picture of a Black doll and a White doll and questions about whether they have positive or negative traits), but be aware of the limitations of forced choice responses (e.g., they may not reflect real-life situations, see Kowalski, 2002). Coming up with open-ended questions may be a useful class activity after reading some of the recommended literature above. *Make sure to obtain permission from parents before interviewing individuals under 18.*
  - B. Interview with a child between 12 and 18. This interview could include open-ended questions or a survey. A racial identity survey may be utilized for such a project (see p. 18 for survey options). A follow-up interview may also be good. It may be interesting to ask students about their experiences being a member of their ethnic/racial group, potential experiences with discrimination, and ethnic/racial socialization messages from their parents. Again, coming up with open-ended questions may be a good class activity. *Make sure to obtain permission from parents before interviewing individuals under 18.*

These age groups are rough estimates and may differ based on the focus of the course.

An alternative to interviewing children is to interview parents. This may be easier logistically. Given you'll generally have more access to adults and given that it may be easier to ask parents about sensitive topics. Parents could complete a survey about their ethnic/racial socialization practices. Interviewing parents of different ethnic/racial groups and/or parents of children at different developmental stages for comparison would be especially useful.

An easier alternative would be a parent panel to discuss parenting around ethnicity/race-related issues at different stages. It would be especially interesting to interview both parents of children and of adolescents and both White parents and parents of color. Relevant topics could include whether ethnicity/race has come up as a topic of conversation, adolescents' ethnic/racial identity development, and the ethnic/racial makeup of their environment. Lastly, as noted before, coming up with questions could be a particularly useful activity for the class as a whole.

## Media Resources

- I. How Can I Have a Positive Racial Identity? I'm White! | Ali Michael | TEDxCheltenham  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hxXMf5K1W6E&t=683s>

This video is a TED talk of Ali Michael discussing her journey through racial identity, from childhood to present. Michael discusses her color-evasive ideology, her experience in a class as a turning point, and her journey to becoming anti-racist. This video is helpful in providing students an opportunity to hear about White racial identity development from a first hand perspective and provides them the opportunity to identify the stages in the video.

- II. Multiracial American Voices: Identity - Pew Research Center  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=l2WaNmhvEzo>

A number of individuals are interviewed about their racial identity and the psychological process of defining themselves. Individuals make a number of different choices (some choose to identify with one racial group, others with multiple) and it often depends on their phenotype (i.e., how much one's looks fit in with the prototype of their self-identified racial background). Students are able to see how racial identity can shift over time and how racial identity develops differently for multiracial (vs. monoracial) individuals.

- I. A Conversation with Native Americans about Race  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=siMal6QVbIE>

Discussion of Native American racial identity. There is not an overarching, well-cited racial identity development model for Native Americans, but this video engages the question of blood quantum, stereotypes about Native Americans, and the struggle for identity. Can be paired with a discussion of universal models of racial identity (e.g., Helms's People of Color racial identity model).

- II. A Conversation with Latinos on Race  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tLLCHbCgJbM&t=14s>

A video that touches on a number of issues around ethnic/racial identification, language, and the dynamic and political nature of ethnic/racial identity. Discussions of growing up and feeling a sense of shame, loss, and color-consciousness are also prevalent. A good video for discussing the dynamic nature of ethnic/racial identity development among Latinx people. Also useful for discussing multiracial/multiethnic identity.

- III. What dark skinned people will never tell you  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=76X4JvjpXug>

While this video does not focus on a specific ethnic or racial group, it dovetails nicely with any discussion of the pre-encounter type stages of racial identity development models. While it focuses on color-consciousness and negative perceptions of dark skin, it includes discussion of feelings of shame and embarrassment in childhood and attempts to address these feelings through assimilation. This is also a good video for discussing *why* pre-encounter may be a stage some go through (e.g., peer discrimination, lack of acceptance, etc.)

- IV. Kids on Race: <http://ac360.blogs.cnn.com/category/kids-on-race/> - this is a series exploring kids' understanding of and beliefs about race and different racial groups. The series is fairly comprehensive, with interviews of parents and kids of varying racial backgrounds. While the series is more news-oriented than scientific, scientists (e.g., Melanie Killen, Margaret Beale-Spencer) were consulted in designing some of the experiments. This series is a helpful complement to theoretical/scientific discussions of children's racial attitudes. The following are in order, such that the studies and discussions build on each other via different types of biases, different racial groups, and different age groups. However, each video can be used in isolation depending on the topic being discussed.
- A. Inside the AC360 doll study: Focuses on White elementary aged children's responses to questions about whether darker or lighter skinned children have more/fewer positive and negative traits.  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DYCz1ppTjiM>
  - B. Study shows how children view race bias: Focuses on Black elementary aged children's responses to questions about whether darker or lighter skinned children have more/fewer positive and negative traits.  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EQACkg5i4AY>
  - C. A Look at Race Relations through a Child's Eyes: Interviews with kids about why racial biases exist (both young children and pre-adolescents) - focuses on parental socialization of Black and White children  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GPVNIJgfDwpw&t=18s>
  - D. Kids speak their minds about race: Interviews with kids about why racial biases exist (adolescents) - focuses on parental socialization and discrimination experiences of Black children and racial diversity  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9OKgUdQF-Fg>
  - E. Subconscious racial bias in children: Focuses on one adolescent showing implicit bias in study; her parents are interviewed  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nFbvBJULVnc>



## Tips and Pitfalls

### Pitfall #1

Be aware that there are limitations to ethnic/racial identity development models, which may be an area for discussion in the classroom. Students may ask: Does everyone go through all these stages? This is a good time to explain that these models are theories and that there are a number of alternative theories and critiques of existing theories. Main critiques of identity models discussed in the literature are (Mio, Barker, Domenech Rodriguez, & Gonzalez, 2019):

- I. Identity models assume everyone goes through all the stages (e.g., all Black people start off feeling negatively about being Black). This is unlikely to be true for everyone (see Cross, 1995 for discussion).
- II. Identity models assume linear progression through the stages. It is likely the case that identity is dynamic in nature and therefore, someone can be at an “Internalization” level and then return to “Immersion/Emersion” after experiencing a racist event (see Cross, 1995; Helms, 1995 for discussion).
- III. Finally, there is an assumption in many identity models that the end-point (e.g., internalization) is ideal for healthy outcomes; however, the health of any racial identity may depend heavily on a number of contextual factors.

It should be noted that many ethnic/racial identity researchers have acknowledged these limitations. For example, some have changed their discussion of racial identity “stages” to racial identity “statuses” to indicate the non-linear, dynamic nature of racial identity development (see Helms, 1995).

### Pitfall #2

Students may tend to say that they are at one of the later stages of development. However, it is useful to get them to think critically about whether or not they have really “arrived” and to emphasize that being at an earlier stage is not a bad thing, but rather an opportunity for growth. One way to avoid students overestimating their ethnic/racial identity development is to provide specific examples of what each stage may look like (e.g., a potential demonstration of autonomy might be having participated in community organizing related to racial equity). Another way to help students think critically about where they are may be to have them take a survey (see below). It should be noted however that these surveys do not always have clear scoring guidelines.

#### Survey Options:

- C. The Racial Identity Attitude Scale (RIAS),
- D. The Multigroup Ethnic Identity Measure (MEIM):  
<https://www.calstatela.edu/sites/default/files/academic/psych/ftp/meim.doc>
- E. The People of Color Racial Identity Attitude Scale (PCRIS)
- F. The White Racial Identity Attitude Scale (WRIAS)

These surveys may be requested through Interlibrary Loan on the PsycTESTS database (MEIM survey is linked).

**Tip #1**

There are a number of models that may be more specific to your subject matter. There are ethnic/racial identity models specific to certain ethnic/racial backgrounds that may not have been mentioned here. Because of this, it may be worth using PsycInfo or Google Scholar to find relevant articles.

**Tip #2**

Keep in mind that this is an emerging field. As noted in tip #1, it is important to investigate current literature. Much of what has been included here is seminal to the field, but there are many current questions and issues being explored. A quick database search may yield new and interesting papers that may be especially relevant for your course.